



Identifying Evaluation Metrics for Richmond's Participatory Budgeting Process



VCU

Brittany Keegan, Ph.D.
VCU Wilder School of Government and Public Affairs
May 3, 2023

Why Evaluate?

An evaluation can help us...

- Ensure the success of a project,
- Identify any problems early on,
- Provide transparency and involvement opportunities for stakeholders, and
- Advocate for continuation and growth of the project.

Stakeholder Engagement

Potential Stakeholders

- Members of the wider community who directly participated in the process,
- Members of the wider community who did not directly participate in the process,
- Community leaders,
- Partner organizations, and
- Members of City Council

Important Considerations

- How would stakeholders like to be contacted?
- How would stakeholders like to be involved?
- How can stakeholders be supported as they participate?

Goal Setting

S

- Specific

M

- Measureable

A

- Attainable

R

- Relevant

T

- Time-Bound

Some Examples

Boston, MA	Cambridge, MA	Vallejo, CA	Greensboro, NC	Durham, NC	Chicago, IL
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Increase youth power• Build stronger, safer, and healthier communities	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Have meaningful social and community impact• Create easy and seamless civic engagement	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Improve the city• Open up government	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Equity• Empowerment	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Implement projects that serve the most marginalized communities• Build greater equity by allocating resources in ways that correct past harm	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Community-building• Inclusion

Creating Evaluation Questions

Type of question	Potential participatory budgeting information provided
Demographic questions	Who was involved with the participatory budgeting process?
Behavior questions	What did people do during their time being involved with the participatory budgeting process?
Value/opinion questions	<p>To what extent is participatory budgeting important to those involved in the process?</p> <p>Overall, how did people feel about their time being involved in the participatory budgeting process?</p>
Motivation questions	Why did someone choose to get involved in the participatory budgeting process?
Knowledge questions	<p>What do people know about what happened during the participatory budgeting process?</p> <p>What do people know about the outcomes of the participatory budgeting process?</p>
Experience questions	Did people have a positive, neutral, or negative experience when they were involved in the participatory budgeting process?
Fact questions	What were the outcomes of the participatory budgeting process?

Examples from Public Agenda

“[The] shared language to evaluate and compare PB processes [in North America]”

-(Participatory Budgeting Project, 2015).

Examples from Public Agenda

Three primary categories:

- Civic and political life
- Inclusion and equity
- Government

Primary Category	Overarching question	Metric(s)
Civic and political life	To what extent does PB engage a significant and growing number of residents, including those who cannot or do not participate in mainstream political life?	Number of PB participants and percent of eligible residents who participate.
Civic and political life	To what extent does PB foster collaboration between civil society organizations and government?	Number of nongovernmental and community-based organizations involved in PB
Civic and political life	Is PB associated with elected officials' political careers?	Number and percent of elected officials reelected
Inclusion and equity	Is PB engaging traditionally marginalized communities?	Number and percent of participants who are of low SES and/or people of color; and relative to demographics in jurisdiction and most recent local election.
Inclusion and equity	Through what means does PB facilitate participation?	Accessibility indicators for idea collection phase, project development phase and voting.
Inclusion and equity	Is PB fostering equitable distribution of resources?	Allocation of PB funds by project type (to be compared with the allocation of comparable funds prior to PB).
Government	How are the number of PB processes and dollar amounts allocated to PB changing from year to year?	Number of new, continued and discontinued PB processes from year to year. Amount and percent of funds allocated to PB projects.
Government	What is the implementation rate of winning PB projects?	Project completion rates and final project costs.
Government	Are additional resources being allocated to projects or needs identified through PB?	Amount of additional money allocated to projects and needs identified through PB.
Government	What is the cost to government of implementing PB?	Dollar amount spent on PB implementation

Examples from Other Cities

City	Primary Evaluation Categories
Durham, NC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Idea collection • Proposal development • Voting • Program administration
Greensboro, NC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overall impact • Adequacy of staffing • Clarity of project parameters • Clarity of the approval process • Quality of public outreach
New York City, NY	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extent to which the project met its goals • Project outcomes • The ultimate impact of the project • Extent of challenges faced during project implementation
Chicago, IL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community building • Equity • Inclusion

Conducting a Self-Evaluation

Goal	Related metric(s)	Potential evaluation question(s)
A steering commission with the capacity and resources to see the project through	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Having enough time to participate on the commission • Having a variety of skills represented on the commission to address all aspects of the work • Having enough funding for the commission to successfully meet its goals • Perception of the level of support from the City of Richmond 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Did you ever have trouble balancing your time spent on the commission with your other commitments? • Are there any personal skills that you think were missing from the commission? If so, what were they? • Do you feel that the funding received by the commission was not enough, just enough, or more than enough? • Do you feel that the level of support received by the commission from the City of Richmond was not enough, just enough, or more than enough?
A steering commission that worked well with the community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of community members who participated in the participatory budgeting process • Perception of the quality of the commission's relationship with the community 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Do you feel that the number of community members who participated in the participatory budgeting process was not enough, just enough, or more than enough? • On a scale of 1-5, with 5 being the highest and 1 being the lowest, how would you rate the quality of the relationships your commission built with members of the community?
A positive experience for steering commission members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overall perspective of the experience serving on the commission (positive, neutral, or negative) • Perception of the value of the work done by the commission 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If given the opportunity, would you be willing to continue this work in the future? • On a scale of 1-5, with 5 being the highest and 1 being the lowest, how would you rate your experience serving on the commission? • True or False: The work that was completed by the commission made a positive impact on Richmond.
Having ideas as to how the commission could be improved in the future	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Having a sense that some areas of the work were successful • Having a sense that some areas of the work could be improved 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are there any areas of the commission's work went better than expected? If so, what are they? • Are there any areas of the commission's work that you feel could be improved? If so, what are they and how would you improve them?

Thank you!
Any questions?